

1 **Total = 3498 words**

2 **Poor HIV control in HLA-B*27 and -B*57/58 non-controllers is resulted from limited**
3 **number of polyfunctional Gag p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells** 19 words 119 characters

4 NAVAPON TECHAKRIENGKRAI^{1,2}, YADA TANSIRI^{1,2}, POKRATH HANSASUTA^{1*}

5 ¹Division of Virology, Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University

6 ²Interdisciplinary Program, Graduate School, Chulalongkorn University

7 *Corresponding author's address: Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn University, Rama 4 road,
8 Bangkok 10330, Thailand

9 *Corresponding author's email address: Pokrath.H@Chula.ac.th

10 **Source of Funding support:** This work is supported by Government grant (through NRCT and
11 Chulalongkorn University, Thailand). PH is Thailand Research Fund Scholar. NT is funded by
12 Chulalongkorn University Graduate Scholarship to commemorate the 72nd Anniversary of HM King
13 Bhumibol Adulyadej.

14 Some data had been previously presented at Keystone Symposium 2011.

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23 **Abstracts 249 words**

24 Objectives: Analysis of immune response in HIV controllers, a unique group of infected individuals
25 who are able to control HIV naturally, have provided us a chance to investigate the roles of host
26 immune responses in HIV control.

27 Design: In this study, the functional quality of HIV Gag p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses were
28 assessed and compared between the groups of clinically distinct, HLA-B*27, -B*57/58 matched
29 individuals, viraemic-controllers (VC, pVL ≤ 2,000 copies/ml) and non-controllers (NC, pVL > 2,000
30 copies/ml) to determine their impacts on natural HIV clinical outcome.

31 Methods: An *ex vivo* IFN-γ ELISpot assay was used to screen for each individual's HIV Gag p24-
32 specific-T cell responses. Intracellular Cytokine Staining assay was used to determine their functional
33 quality (as number of cytokine being produced).

34 Results: We found that, in contrast to previous studies, all Thai volunteers with HLA-B*5801 were
35 uniformly non-controllers. HIV Gag p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses of VC were with larger
36 number of high functional quality CD8⁺ T cells than those of NC (p < 0.05). This superior quality of
37 responses was observed at both whole p24- and epitope-specific level. Moreover, the absolute
38 number of high functional quality HIV Gag p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells was significantly in a negative
39 correlation with pVL (r = -0.6984, p = 0.0006) and also in a positive correlation with CD4⁺ T cell
40 count (r = 0.5648, p = 0.0095).

41 Conclusion: We concluded that an adequate number of high functional quality Gag p24-specific-CD8⁺
42 T cells is important in order to become a natural HIV controller.

43 **Keywords:** HIV Gag p24, HLA-B*27, HLA-B*57/58, functional quality of CD8⁺ T cell responses, HIV
44 controller

45

46

47

48 **Introduction** 441 words

49 Although antiretroviral therapy (ART) has been demonstrated as an effective way to reduce
50 morbidity, mortality and, more importantly Human Immunodeficiency Virus (HIV) transmission, its
51 deleterious side-effects and cost also put a lifelong burden on its users. Prevention of HIV by vaccine
52 is believed to be the most cost-effective and yet safe intervention for HIV/AIDS epidemic. Decades of
53 disappointing HIV vaccine development has asked us an important question "what are the immune
54 correlates of protection against HIV infection?".

55 Several immunological factors have been linked with HIV control in which HIV-specific-CD8⁺ T
56 cells are convincingly the most important component [1]. Impacts of HIV-specific-CD8⁺ T cells have
57 been evidently demonstrated in a large number of studies, including: reduction of peak viraemia
58 observed during primary infection, higher SIV load and rapid disease progression in CD8⁺-depleted
59 macaque, direct killing of CD4⁺ T cells and suppression of HIV replication [2-8]. Recent evidence
60 showed us that not all T cells were protective against HIV [9]. Presence of HIV-specific T cells
61 defined by **gamma interferon** assay is not indicative of T-cell mediated immunity. Subsequent works
62 confirmed that only T cells with higher functional quality were protective and hence controlling HIV
63 replication in HIV-infected individuals with good clinical outcome [9-11]. These high functional
64 quality or "polyfunctional" T cells are T cells which simultaneously produce multiple
65 cytokines/chemokines, up-regulate surface cytotoxic function such as CD107a and are perhaps with
66 proliferative capacity [12]. Not only functional quality of the HIV-specific T cells, specificity of these T
67 cells is undoubtedly essential to determine level of protection against HIV infection. T cells targeted
68 at capsid p24 of HIV were seen to be associated with low HIV-RNA, while other T cells specific to
69 other proteins seemed to relate with high viral load [13].

70 Amongst associations between HIV control and CD8⁺ T cell responses, the most unequivocal
71 evidence is the protective effect observed with some certain HLA-I alleles [14, 15]. These HLA-I
72 alleles are frequently presented in a unique group of infected individuals termed "HIV controllers",
73 who are able to control HIV naturally (lower than 2,000 copies/ml HIV load). There are 3 HLA-I
74 alleles frequently regarded as "protective alleles": HLA-B*27, -B*57 and -B*58 [14-18]. These
75 associations of HIV control may be hypothetically resulted from T cells recognition of epitopes

76 presented on these 'protective' HLA alleles [18-22]. However, possessing these protective alleles
77 does not guarantee good clinical outcome in HIV-infected individuals, it is interesting to see quality of
78 the T cells in protective allele-matched individuals who have differential control of HIV replication.

79 In this study, we asked whether functional quality of the T cells directing against same p24
80 antigen in protective HLA-I allele-matched controllers and non-controllers were different.

81

82

83

84

85

86

87

88

89

90

91

92

93

94

95

96

97 **Materials and methods** 838 words

98 **Study subjects:** Forty-five chronically HIV infected individuals, from King Chulalongkorn Memorial
99 hospital and HIV clinic, Thai Red Cross Society, were enrolled into this study. All were antiretroviral
100 drug naïve with no opportunistic infections. Signed informed consents were obtained from all
101 individuals. This study was approved by Ethic Committee of Faculty of Medicine, Chulalongkorn
102 University.

103 **Clinical data:** Plasma HIV load (pVL) (Roche, USA), complete blood count (CBC), CD4⁺ and CD8⁺T
104 cell count (Beckman Coulter, USA) were determined at Department of Microbiology, King
105 Chulalongkorn Memorial hospital, Thai Red Cross Society.

106 **Subjects categorization:** Donors were categorized into 2 groups according to their pVL, "viraemic-
107 controllers" (VC, pVL ≤ 2,000 copies/ml) and "non-controllers" (NC, pVL > 2,000 copies/ml) as
108 defined elsewhere [23, 24]. Only donors with consecutively, 3 months apart, pVL control were
109 considered VC.

110 **PBMC preparation:** Peripheral blood mononuclear cells (PBMC) were isolated from
111 ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid (EDTA) blood by standard density-gradient centrifugation using Ficoll
112 Hypaque (Amersham Biosciences, Sweden). Isolated PBMC were either used freshly in an ELISpot
113 assay or rested at 10⁶ PBMC/ml overnight in R10 (RPMI1640 (Gibco, USA) supplemented with 10%
114 heat-inactivated Fetal Bovine Serum (Lonza, USA)) for an intracellular cytokines staining (ICS) assay
115 performing on the following day. The rest were cryo-preserved at -80 °C for future usage.

116 **HLA typing:** HLA class I alleles were typed using both PCR-sequence-specific-oligonucleotides (PCR-
117 SSOP) and PCR-sequence-specific-primers (PCR-SSP) by Proimmune Ltd. (Oxford, UK)

118 **HIV p24 sequencing:** Viral RNA was extracted from 200 µl of fresh or frozen plasma. Reverse
119 transcription-nested PCR were performed using the following primers; 5'-GAGGTGCA
120 CACAGCAAGAGGCG-3', 5'-CCCCCTATCATTTTTG GTTTCC-3' (outer1), 5'-GCGRCTGGTGAGTACGCC-3',
121 5'-RGGAAGGCCAGATYTTCC-3' (outer2) and 5'-GGCGAGAGCGGCGACTGGTGAG-3', 5'-CCCCTCTGT

122 ATCATCTGCTCCTGTATC-3' (inner) for *p24*. All sequences were analyzed using Bioedit Sequence
123 Alignment Editor version 7.0.9.0 [25].

124 **Design of currently circulating HIV Gag p24 overlapping peptides (OLPs) and epitopes:**

125 Twenty-three OLPs (20 overlapped by 10 amino acids) and 7 HLA-B*27, B*57 and B*58 restricted
126 epitopes (supplementary table 1) spanning Gag p24 protein were designed based on a consensus
127 sequence derived from 10 randomly selected HIV infected individuals. The majority of these
128 sequences (9/10) were CRF_01AE subtype (supplementary figure 1). All peptides were synthesized
129 by Mimotopes (Australia).

130 **ELISpot assay:** Gamma Interferon (IFN- γ) ELISpot was performed as follow. In brief, 2.5×10^5
131 freshly isolated PBMC was plated into each well of 96 wells-polyvinylidene-plate (Millipore, USA) which
132 were manually coated for 3 hours with 15 $\mu\text{g/ml}$ of anti IFN- γ mAb (D1K, Mabtech, Sweden) and
133 incubated at 37°C, 5% CO₂ for 15 hours in the presence of 10 $\mu\text{g/ml}$ of each peptide. Each peptide
134 was tested individually and performed in duplicate. Phytohaemagglutinin (Sigma-Aldrich, Germany)
135 and R10 was used as a positive and negative control. After discarding cell suspension, biotinylated-
136 secondary anti IFN- γ mAb (7-B6-1, Mabtech, Sweden) was added at a final concentration of 1 $\mu\text{g/ml}$
137 and incubated in dark for 3 hours. Streptavidin-conjugated-alkaline-phosphatase (Mabtech, Sweden)
138 was then added and incubated for another hour. Plate was developed using alkaline-phosphatase
139 substrate kit (BioRad, USA). Spot forming unit (SFU) were determined using ELISpot reader (Carl-
140 Zeiss, USA) and calculated by subtracting with negative control. Only responses with more than 50
141 SFU/ 10^6 PBMCs and 10 times over the background were considered positive.

142 **P24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells functional quality determination:** Overnight-rested PBMC were
143 washed, resuspended and adjusted with R10 to a concentration of 10^7 PBMC/ml. One hundred
144 microliter of cell suspension was cultured with anti-human CD28, anti-human CD49d, anti-human
145 CD107a PE-Cy5 (Beckton Dickinson, USA), Brefeldin-A (Sigma-Aldrich, Germany) and 10 $\mu\text{g/ml}$ of
146 each ELISpot-responding peptide and incubated at 37°C, 5% CO₂ for 6 hours. Streptococcus
147 enterotoxin B (Sigma-Aldrich, Germany), irrelevant peptide and dimethyl sulfoxide (DMSO) (Sigma-
148 Aldrich, Germany) were used as positive and negative control. PBMC were then stained with anti-
149 human CD3 APC-H7 (Beckton Dickinson, USA) and anti-human CD8 Pacific Blue (Biolegend, USA) and

150 incubated for another 20 minutes. PBMC were permeabilized using Cytofix/Cytoperm (Beckton
151 Dickinson, USA) according to user manual and stained with anti-human IL2 FITC, anti-human TNF- α
152 APC, anti-human IFN- γ PE-Cy7 (Biolegend, USA) and anti-human MIP1- β PE (Beckton Dickinson, USA)
153 for an additional 30 minutes. PBMC were fixed with 1% paraformaldehyde in phosphate buffer saline
154 (Sigma-Aldrich, Germany), kept at 4°C overnight and analyzed on FACS Aria II (Beckton Dickinson,
155 USA). All analyses were performed using FACSDiva software version 6.1.2 (Beckton Dickinson, USA).
156 Only CD3⁺CD8⁺ T lymphocytes were taken into account as shown in gating strategy (supplementary
157 figure 2). Specific CD8⁺ T cell responses were calculated by subtracting with negative control. Only
158 responses above background level were considered positive. CBC and CD8⁺ T cell count data were
159 used to calculate absolute numbers of responding cells. Multi-parameter analyses were performed
160 using FCOM algorithm on WinList software (Verity Software House, USA). With the 5 cytokine being
161 investigated, total number of 32 possible functionally-distinct CD8⁺ T cell subpopulations (functional-
162 phenotypes) was generated. Individuals' absolute number of each functional-phenotype was used to
163 calculate group median which was subsequently compared to determine the differences between
164 groups.

165 **Statistical analysis:** All statistical analyses were performed using Prism version 5 (Graphpad
166 Software, USA). Two-tailed, Mann-Whitney U test was used to compare group median and Spearman
167 R test was used to determine a correlation. P value < 0.05 was considered statistic significance.

168

169

170

171

172

173

174

175 **Results** 1266 words

176 **Protective HLA-I alleles were not associated with HIV control**

177 We categorized donors in this study according to their plasma HIV load (pVL) to reflect their
178 HIV control ability. Indeed, viraemic-controllers (VC, n=13) were with better clinical outcome than
179 non-controllers (NC, n =32) as reflected by absolute CD4⁺ count (table 1). This difference was not
180 due to their stage of HIV infection since their median time after first diagnosis was similar (table 1).
181 HLA-B*27, -B*57 and -B*58 have been shown to be associated with HIV control [14-18]. To
182 determine the influence of these "protective-alleles", donors were categorized according to their HLA-
183 I into 2 groups: subjects with protective-allele(s) (PA, n = 19) and subjects without protective-
184 allele(s) (nPA, n = 26). Surprisingly, both CD4⁺ count and pVL were not different between PA and
185 nPA (table 1). This comparable clinical outcome was independent of HIV duration and other
186 demographic characteristics (table1). Indeed, there was a similar proportion of PA in both VC (70%)
187 and NC (60%). It was apparent that mere presence and absence of protective-allele(s) was not
188 associated with clinical outcome in this study. This finding suggested that possession of protective-
189 allele(s) per se might not be sufficient to arm HIV-infected individuals with protective HIV immunity,
190 and additional factors would be required to confer an ability to control HIV.

191 **Interferon- γ producing T-cells were of similar characteristic between VC and NC**

192 In order to determine the protective effect of HIV-specific-T cells, we investigated p24-
193 specific-T cell responses in fresh PBMC by an interferon- γ (IFN- γ) ELISpot assay. There were 4 non-
194 responders, 3 VC and 1 NC which were excluded from further investigations. Overall, both NC and
195 VC mediated the same breadth of responses (median = 3 OLPs). Although VC seemed to mount
196 higher magnitude of responses than NC, it was not statistically significant (table 2A). Different HLA-I
197 restriction might have an effect on both breadth and magnitude of T-cell responses. These
198 differences were likely due to the frequency of HLA-I alleles which, in turn, having an influence on
199 immunodominance of epitopes in a certain population or patient. In order to exclude impacts of HLA-
200 I restriction, p24-epitopes-specific-T cell responses of VC and NC were analyzed in a PA-matched
201 manner. There were 8 HLA-B*27 positive donors in this study consisting of 4 VC and 4 NC. In this

202 HLA-B*27 positive group, VC had significantly lower pVL than NC (1,104.5 vs. 11,747 copies/ml,
203 $p < 0.05$). Though CD4 count was higher in VC than NC, it did not reach statistic significance (table
204 2B). Similarly, in HLA-B*57/58 positive group, there were 3VC and 9 NC in which VC had significantly
205 lower pVL and higher CD4⁺ count than NC (table 2B). However, better clinical outcome observed in
206 either HLA-B*27 and HLA-B*57/58 positive VC could not simply be explained by their better T-cell
207 responses as estimated by IFN- γ ELISpot assay, since epitope-specific-T cell responses were similar.
208 In addition, the overall p24-specific-T cell responses (as defined by both breadth and median
209 magnitude of T cell responses against 23 OLPs spanning Gag p24 protein) were also not different
210 between these PA-matched VC and NC (table 2B). These findings suggested that, at an epitope-
211 specific level, analysis of IFN- γ producing cells might not be accurate enough for evaluating the
212 protective quality of the p24-specific-T cell responses [9]. **In order to precisely determine an effect of**
213 **T cell responses, we performed an intracellular cytokine staining (ICS) assay to investigate the**
214 **functional quality of p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses in these donors.**

215 **P24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses of VC were of higher functional quality than those of**
216 **NC**

217 Total number of 20 subjects (8 VC and 12 NC) was included in this functional quality
218 assessment by using multi-parametric flow cytometry upon stimulation with each responding peptide
219 previously defined by an IFN- γ ELISpot assay. Fresh PBMC from the same time-point with ELISpot
220 screening were used as results from our preliminary study showed an enhanced sensitivity of cytokine
221 detection when using fresh PBMC as compared to frozen samples (data not shown). Moreover, with
222 the CBC data, we were able to calculate absolute number of responding CD8⁺ T cells, hence allowed
223 us to investigate p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses in their actual number, not the proportion of total
224 lymphocyte.

225 Firstly, p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses were determined as a whole (summation of every
226 single OLP-specific response in each individual). Significantly larger number of high functional quality
227 p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells (defined as having simultaneous 4 or 5 functions) was observed in VC as
228 compared to NC (figure 1A). Next, an absolute number of each possible functional-phenotype was
229 compared between NC and VC to determine its association with HIV control. Though many

230 functional-phenotypes were different between VC and NC, only 3 reached statistical significance; full
231 5 functions, IL-2⁺TNF- α ⁺IFN- γ ⁺CD107a⁺MIP1- β ⁺, 4 functions TNF- α ⁺IFN- γ ⁺CD107a⁺MIP1- β ⁺ and 3
232 functions IFN- γ ⁺CD107a⁺MIP1- β ⁺ (figure 1B). The absolute number of these subpopulations in VC
233 and NC were 47 vs. 0 cell/mm³ (p = 0.01), 352 vs. 62 cell/mm³ (p = 0.0038) and 91 vs. 9 cell/mm³
234 (p = 0.01), respectively. In NC, p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses were dominated by single MIP1- β
235 producing cells (figure 1B).

236 **Discordant HIV control between protective-allele(s) matched donors was attributed from** 237 **the functional quality of CD8⁺ T cell responses**

238 Next, P24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses from VC and NC matching for the same protective
239 HLA-B*27 or HLA-B*57/58 allele were subsequently analyzed to determine whether their diverse
240 clinical outcome was resulted from **their different quality of responses**. In HLA-B*27 group, VC (n=3)
241 exhibited significantly more p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells with 5 functions than did NC (n=4) (437 vs. 0
242 cell/mm³, p < 0.05). Although several other functional-phenotypes were also higher in VC than NC,
243 these differences were not statistically significant (figure 2A). We next determined their quality of
244 response against an HLA-B*27 restricted epitope, KRWIILGLNK (KK10). Significantly larger number
245 of full 5 functions, KK10-specific-CD8⁺ T cells was observed in VC than NC (figure 2B). Similarly, HLA-
246 B*57/58 positive VC (n=3) possessed significantly larger number of **p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells with 5**
247 **functions than did NC (n=5) (23 vs. 0 cell/mm³, p < 0.05) (figure 2C). However, there were not**
248 **enough number of responders to assess each of the 6 HLA-B*57/58-restricted epitope being**
249 **investigated individually, they were accumulated as a summation of all the responding epitopes of**
250 **each subjects. Though, larger number of 5 functions CD8⁺ T cells was observed in VC than NC, it did**
251 **not reach statistic significance (figure 2D).**

252

253

254

255

256 **Better clinical outcome could be explained by an absolute number of high functional**
257 **quality p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells**

258 Results from our previous experiments had demonstrated an association between high
259 functional quality CD8⁺ T cell responses and good clinical outcome in both whole p24 protein specific
260 and a single epitope level (figure 1-2). We next determined the relationship between functional
261 quality of p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell responses and readouts of HIV clinical outcome (CD4⁺ count and
262 pVL). Significantly lower level of pVL was observed in HIV-1 infected donors possessing p24-specific-
263 CD8⁺ T cells with full 5 functions (n=11) compared to those who did not (n=9) (figure 3A). In
264 addition, these donors with full 5 functions CD8⁺ T cells also had significantly higher level of CD4⁺
265 count (figure 3B). Furthermore, an absolute number of CD8⁺ T cells with full 5 functions and 4
266 functions were significantly in negative correlation with pVL ($r = -0.6984$, $p = 0.0006$ and $r = -0.5729$
267 $p = 0.0083$, respectively)(figure 3C and 3E) and in positive correlation with CD4⁺ T cells count ($r =$
268 0.5648 , $p = 0.0095$ and $r = 0.4567$, $p = 0.0429$, respectively) (figure 3D and 3F). These data
269 suggested that good clinical outcome observed in VC was strongly associated with their absolute
270 number of high functional quality p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells.

271

272

273

274

275

276

277

278

279

280 **Discussion** 953 words

281 This study examined the functional quality of the immunodominant antigen-specific CD8⁺ T-
282 cell responses in Thai individuals mostly infected with CRF01_AE virus. Roles of host immune
283 response in HIV control are better illustrated in a unique group of HIV infected individuals called "HIV
284 controllers" who are able to maintain low HIV load without anti-retroviral treatment for years. In this
285 study, we demonstrated that mere presence of some previously defined "protective alleles" (HLA-
286 B*27, -B*57 and -B*58) per se did not guarantee this controller status. The previously-described
287 protective allele "HLA-B*5801" did not confer any protective effect in our study. In fact, all HLA-
288 B*5801 volunteers were non-controllers. Moreover, we also demonstrated that an ability to control
289 HIV was strongly associated with absolute number of Gag p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cells with high
290 functional quality.

291 Presence or absence of an HLA-B*27-restricted KRWILGLNK (KK10)-specific T-cell response
292 was demonstrated to determine HIV loads in HLA-B*27⁺ individuals [26-28]. In our study, however,
293 the comparable frequency and magnitude of the KK10 response was seen in VC and NC. Unlike
294 previous observation [26, 28, 29], epitope escape mutation did not explain failure to mediate T-cell
295 response in KK-10 non-responder (data not shown). However, high resolution HLA analysis revealed
296 that HLA-B*27 of the non-responders was indeed HLA-B*2706 whilst KK10 responders had HLA-
297 B*2704 and -B*2705 alleles. Lack of KK10 response in the non-responders might be related to
298 differential epitope-binding properties amongst HLA-B*27 subtypes. HLA-B*2705-KK10 crystal
299 structure has demonstrated that residues 77 and 116 are key residues in determining F-pocket
300 binding affinity [30]. Replacing wild type acidic aspartic acid residue at position 77 with nucleophilic
301 serine (as observed in HLA-B*2704) may have minor effect on KK10 epitope recognition, since HLA-
302 B*2704⁺ individuals seem to recognize KK10 equally well. On the other hand, substitution of aspartic
303 acid at residue 116 with bulky aromatic side chain tyrosine (as observed in HLA-B*2706) may
304 abrogate binding of KK10 epitope and lead to failure of the T-cell response in HLA-B*2706⁺
305 individuals.

306 Due to the limited number of only 1.3% HLA-B*5701 carriers in Thai population [31] and
307 since HLA-B*5701 or HLA-B*5801 are both members of HLA-B58 supertype which share the same

308 binding specificity [30], study of these HLA restricted T cell responses were considered as a combined
309 group of HLA-B*57/58 positive individuals in this study. Unlike HLA-B*27, HLA-B*57/58 presents
310 more than 1 HIV Gag p24 epitopes [18, 21, 22, 32-35]. The strong association observed between
311 HLA-B*57/58 and HIV control is hypothetically resulted from CD8⁺ T cell responses against these
312 high fitness cost epitopes [14]. Indeed, sequential escape mutations of these epitopes resulting in
313 narrowing the breadth of the HLA-B*57/58-restricted T cell responses have been shown to be
314 associated with loss of control [21, 22]. In our study, however, HLA-B*57/58-restricted p24-specific
315 breadth and magnitude of responses determined by IFN γ ELISpot assays in NC were not different
316 from those observed in VC. This finding may suggest that an ability to secrete IFN γ per se is not
317 sufficient for controlling HIV infection. Other T-cell functional characteristics may be needed in order
318 to mediate quality T-cell response [1, 9, 12, 36, 37].

319 Estimation of polyfunctional p24-specific CD8⁺ T cells in proportion to CD8⁺ T cell population
320 or in an absolute number (by calculation with CBC) pointed out that VC had more polyfunctional than
321 NC. Similar to previous studies, most T-cell response mediated by NC had only 2-3 functions [9, 38].
322 Of note, some NC had high proportion of high functional T cells but the absolute numbers were
323 significantly lower than those owned by VC. The fact that total CD8⁺ count of NC and VC were
324 similar emphasized that the absolute number of high functional quality T cells was essential for HIV
325 control.

326 Detailed mechanisms to explain discrepancy of the T cell quality in HLA-matched NC and VC
327 remain unclear. However, either viral or host factors are potentially important in determining quality
328 of the T cells. As escape from T-cell response, unlike previously defined, may be not all-or-none
329 event. The virus might preferentially interfere the most potent antiviral function(s) whilst leaving
330 another one(s) untouched. Variations within a given epitope, though maintaining certain affinity to
331 HLA molecule and T-cell receptor (TCR), this less-than-optimal interaction of TCR-HLA/peptide
332 complex may lead to (stepwise) abrogation of T-cell functions. We speculated that IL-2 function is
333 perhaps the most vulnerable to be suppressed upon HIV escape? Lack of IL-2, in turn, leads to less
334 of proliferative capacity of T cells and hence being of poor quality. This speculation helps explain
335 sequential T-cell function loss when T-cell functional quality of NC and VC were cross-sectionally

336 compared (data not shown). In fact, the similar trend was also observed in individuals when they are
337 in controller status compared to the same ones when they progressed to non-controller status. On
338 the other hand, host factors such as T-cell antigen sensitivity, proliferative capacity, senescence and
339 repertoire may also be important for determining quality of HIV-specific T cell response [39-43]. High
340 antigen sensitivity and proliferative capacity with broader and cross-reactive T cells are favourable
341 and are likely to be characteristics of the VC. Although proliferative capacity of the T cells in this study
342 was not directly investigated, analysis of IL-2 producing CD8⁺ HIV-specific T cells could reflect this
343 particular function of the T cells. In our study, the fact that only VC having the IL-2-producing T cells
344 suggests that the high quality T cells in these individuals are continuously maintained by renewal of
345 similar quality clones.

346 In conclusion, this study helps extend the previous observation in subtype B-infected
347 individuals that functional quality of p24-specific-CD8⁺ T cell response is also the main contributing
348 factor for natural control of HIV in CRF01_AE-infected individuals. Our finding in HLA-B*2706⁺ and
349 HLA-B*5801⁺ NC suggests that studies in diverse immunogenetic population infected with non-
350 subtype B HIV are warranted.

351 **Acknowledgements**

352 This work is supported by Government grant (through NRCT and Chulalongkorn University,
353 Thailand). NT was funded by Chulalongkorn University Graduate Scholarship to commemorate the
354 72nd Anniversary of HM King Bhumibol Adulyadej. We thank Assoc. Prof. Jintanart Ananworanich
355 and staff at Men Health clinic, Thai Red Cross society for patient enrolment. We also thank Ms.
356 Supranee Buranapraditkul and Mr. Vittawat Jitnaitam for their technical assistance.

357 **Conflicts of Interest**

358 There were no conflicts of interest in this study.

359 **Sequences**

360 All sequences were submitted to GenBank with the following accession numbers:
361 JN704002 - JN704066.

- 363 1. O'Connell KA, Bailey JR, Blankson JN. Elucidating the elite: mechanisms of control in HIV-1 infection. *Trends Pharmacol Sci* 2009;**30**:631-
364 637.
- 365 2. Jin X, Roberts CG, Nixon DF, Cao Y, Ho DD, Walker BD, *et al.* Longitudinal and cross-sectional analysis of cytotoxic T lymphocyte
366 responses and their relationship to vertical human immunodeficiency virus transmission. ARIEL Project Investigators. *J Infect Dis*
367 1998;**178**:1317-1326.
- 368 3. Matano T, Shibata R, Siemon C, Connors M, Lane HC, Martin MA. Administration of an anti-CD8 monoclonal antibody interferes with the
369 clearance of chimeric simian/human immunodeficiency virus during primary infections of rhesus macaques. *J Virol* 1998;**72**:164-169.
- 370 4. Schmitz JE, Kuroda MJ, Santra S, Sasseville VG, Simon MA, Lifton MA, *et al.* Control of viremia in simian immunodeficiency virus
371 infection by CD8+ lymphocytes. *Science* 1999;**283**:857-860.
- 372 5. Borrow P, Lewicki H, Hahn BH, Shaw GM, Oldstone MB. Virus-specific CD8+ cytotoxic T-lymphocyte activity associated with control of
373 viremia in primary human immunodeficiency virus type 1 infection. *J Virol* 1994;**68**:6103-6110.
- 374 6. Klein MR, van Baalen CA, Holwerda AM, Kerkhof Garde SR, Bende RJ, Keet IP, *et al.* Kinetics of Gag-specific cytotoxic T lymphocyte
375 responses during the clinical course of HIV-1 infection: a longitudinal analysis of rapid progressors and long-term asymptomatics. *J Exp Med*
376 1995;**181**:1365-1372.
- 377 7. Koup RA, Safrit JT, Cao Y, Andrews CA, McLeod G, Borkowsky W, *et al.* Temporal association of cellular immune responses with the
378 initial control of viremia in primary human immunodeficiency virus type 1 syndrome. *J Virol* 1994;**68**:4650-4655.
- 379 8. Walker BD, Chakrabarti S, Moss B, Paradis TJ, Flynn T, Durno AG, *et al.* HIV-specific cytotoxic T lymphocytes in seropositive individuals.
380 *Nature* 1987;**328**:345-348.
- 381 9. Betts MR, Nason MC, West SM, De Rosa SC, Migueles SA, Abraham J, *et al.* HIV nonprogressors preferentially maintain highly functional
382 HIV-specific CD8+ T cells. *Blood* 2006;**107**:4781-4789.
- 383 10. Betts MR, Ambrozak DR, Douek DC, Bonhoeffer S, Brenchley JM, Casazza JP, *et al.* Analysis of total human immunodeficiency virus
384 (HIV)-specific CD4(+) and CD8(+) T-cell responses: relationship to viral load in untreated HIV infection. *J Virol* 2001;**75**:11983-11991.
- 385 11. Gea-Banacloche JC, Migueles SA, Martino L, Shupert WL, McNeil AC, Sabbaghian MS, *et al.* Maintenance of large numbers of virus-
386 specific CD8+ T cells in HIV-infected progressors and long-term nonprogressors. *J Immunol* 2000;**165**:1082-1092.
- 387 12. Seder RA, Darrah PA, Roederer M. T-cell quality in memory and protection: implications for vaccine design. *Nat Rev Immunol* 2008;**8**:247-
388 258.
- 389 13. Kiepiela P, Ngumbela K, Thobakgale C, Ramduth D, Honeyborne I, Moodley E, *et al.* CD8+ T-cell responses to different HIV proteins have
390 discordant associations with viral load. *Nat Med* 2007;**13**:46-53.
- 391 14. Goulder PJ, Watkins DI. Impact of MHC class I diversity on immune control of immunodeficiency virus replication. *Nat Rev Immunol*
392 2008;**8**:619-630.
- 393 15. Migueles SA, Sabbaghian MS, Shupert WL, Bettinotti MP, Marincola FM, Martino L, *et al.* HLA B*5701 is highly associated with restriction
394 of virus replication in a subgroup of HIV-infected long term nonprogressors. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2000;**97**:2709-2714.
- 395 16. Altfeld M, Addo MM, Rosenberg ES, Hecht FM, Lee PK, Vogel M, *et al.* Influence of HLA-B57 on clinical presentation and viral control
396 during acute HIV-1 infection. *AIDS* 2003;**17**:2581-2591.
- 397 17. Kaslow RA, Carrington M, Apple R, Park L, Munoz A, Saah AJ, *et al.* Influence of combinations of human major histocompatibility complex
398 genes on the course of HIV-1 infection. *Nat Med* 1996;**2**:405-411.
- 399 18. Leslie AJ, Pfafferoth KJ, Chetty P, Draenert R, Addo MM, Feeney M, *et al.* HIV evolution: CTL escape mutation and reversion after
400 transmission. *Nat Med* 2004;**10**:282-289.
- 401 19. Schneidewind A, Brockman MA, Sidney J, Wang YE, Chen H, Suscovich TJ, *et al.* Structural and functional constraints limit options for
402 cytotoxic T-lymphocyte escape in the immunodominant HLA-B27-restricted epitope in human immunodeficiency virus type 1 capsid. *J Virol*
403 2008;**82**:5594-5605.
- 404 20. Schneidewind A, Brockman MA, Yang R, Adam RI, Li B, Le Gall S, *et al.* Escape from the dominant HLA-B27-restricted cytotoxic T-
405 lymphocyte response in Gag is associated with a dramatic reduction in human immunodeficiency virus type 1 replication. *J Virol*
406 2007;**81**:12382-12393.

- 407 21. Martinez-Picado J, Prado JG, Fry EE, Pfafferoth K, Leslie A, Chetty S, *et al.* Fitness cost of escape mutations in p24 Gag in association with
408 control of human immunodeficiency virus type 1. *J Virol* 2006;**80**:3617-3623.
- 409 22. Crawford H, Prado JG, Leslie A, Hue S, Honeyborne I, Reddy S, *et al.* Compensatory mutation partially restores fitness and delays reversion
410 of escape mutation within the immunodominant HLA-B*5703-restricted Gag epitope in chronic human immunodeficiency virus type 1
411 infection. *J Virol* 2007;**81**:8346-8351.
- 412 23. Walker BD. Elite control of HIV Infection: implications for vaccines and treatment. *Top HIV Med* 2007;**15**:134-136.
- 413 24. Baker BM, Block BL, Rothchild AC, Walker BD. Elite control of HIV infection: implications for vaccine design. *Expert Opin Biol Ther*
414 2009;**9**:55-69.
- 415 25. Hall TA. BioEdit: a user-friendly biological sequence alignment editor and analysis
416 program for Windows 95/98/NT. *Nucl. Acids. Symp. Ser.* 1999;**41**:95-98.
- 417 26. Ammaranond P, Zaunders J, Satchell C, van Bockel D, Cooper DA, Kelleher AD. A new variant cytotoxic T lymphocyte escape mutation in
418 HLA-B27-positive individuals infected with HIV type 1. *AIDS Res Hum Retroviruses* 2005;**21**:395-397.
- 419 27. Goulder PJ, Brander C, Tang Y, Tremblay C, Colbert RA, Addo MM, *et al.* Evolution and transmission of stable CTL escape mutations in
420 HIV infection. *Nature* 2001;**412**:334-338.
- 421 28. Goulder PJ, Phillips RE, Colbert RA, McAdam S, Ogg G, Nowak MA, *et al.* Late escape from an immunodominant cytotoxic T-lymphocyte
422 response associated with progression to AIDS. *Nat Med* 1997;**3**:212-217.
- 423 29. Kelleher AD, Long C, Holmes EC, Allen RL, Wilson J, Conlon C, *et al.* Clustered mutations in HIV-1 gag are consistently required for
424 escape from HLA-B27-restricted cytotoxic T lymphocyte responses. *J Exp Med* 2001;**193**:375-386.
- 425 30. Sidney J, Peters B, Frahm N, Brander C, Sette A. HLA class I supertypes: a revised and updated classification. *BMC Immunol* 2008;**9**:1.
- 426 31. Gonzalez-Galarza FF, Christmas S, Middleton D, Jones AR. Allele frequency net: a database and online repository for immune gene
427 frequencies in worldwide populations. *Nucleic Acids Res* 2011;**39**:D913-919.
- 428 32. Brockman MA, Schneidewind A, Lahaie M, Schmidt A, Miura T, Desouza I, *et al.* Escape and compensation from early HLA-B57-mediated
429 cytotoxic T-lymphocyte pressure on human immunodeficiency virus type 1 Gag alter capsid interactions with cyclophilin A. *J Virol*
430 2007;**81**:12608-12618.
- 431 33. Draener R, Le Gall S, Pfafferoth KJ, Leslie AJ, Chetty P, Brander C, *et al.* Immune selection for altered antigen processing leads to cytotoxic
432 T lymphocyte escape in chronic HIV-1 infection. *J Exp Med* 2004;**199**:905-915.
- 433 34. Miura T, Brockman MA, Schneidewind A, Lobritz M, Pereyra F, Rathod A, *et al.* HLA-B57/B*5801 human immunodeficiency virus type 1
434 elite controllers select for rare gag variants associated with reduced viral replication capacity and strong cytotoxic T-lymphocyte [corrected]
435 recognition. *J Virol* 2009;**83**:2743-2755.
- 436 35. Navis M, Schellens I, van Baarle D, Borghans J, van Swieten P, Miedema F, *et al.* Viral replication capacity as a correlate of HLA
437 B57/B5801-associated nonprogressive HIV-1 infection. *J Immunol* 2007;**179**:3133-3143.
- 438 36. Bangham CR. CTL quality and the control of human retroviral infections. *Eur J Immunol* 2009;**39**:1700-1712.
- 439 37. Blankson JN. Effector mechanisms in HIV-1 infected elite controllers: highly active immune responses? *Antiviral Res* 2010;**85**:295-302.
- 440 38. Owen RE, Heitman JW, Hirschhorn DF, Lanteri MC, Biswas HH, Martin JN, *et al.* HIV+ elite controllers have low HIV-specific T-cell
441 activation yet maintain strong, polyfunctional T-cell responses. *AIDS* 2010;**24**:1095-1105.
- 442 39. Almeida JR, Price DA, Papagno L, Arkoub ZA, Sauce D, Bornstein E, *et al.* Superior control of HIV-1 replication by CD8+ T cells is
443 reflected by their avidity, polyfunctionality, and clonal turnover. *J Exp Med* 2007;**204**:2473-2485.
- 444 40. Almeida JR, Sauce D, Price DA, Papagno L, Shin SY, Moris A, *et al.* Antigen sensitivity is a major determinant of CD8+ T-cell
445 polyfunctionality and HIV-suppressive activity. *Blood* 2009;**113**:6351-6360.
- 446 41. Kosmrlj A, Read EL, Qi Y, Allen TM, Altfeld M, Deeks SG, *et al.* Effects of thymic selection of the T-cell repertoire on HLA class I-
447 associated control of HIV infection. *Nature* 2010;**465**:350-354.
- 448 42. Migueles SA, Laborico AC, Shupert WL, Sabbaghian MS, Rabin R, Hallahan CW, *et al.* HIV-specific CD8+ T cell proliferation is coupled to
449 perforin expression and is maintained in nonprogressors. *Nat Immunol* 2002;**3**:1061-1068.
- 450 43. Streeck H, Brumme ZL, Anastario M, Cohen KW, Jolin JS, Meier A, *et al.* Antigen load and viral sequence diversification determine the
451 functional profile of HIV-1-specific CD8+ T cells. *PLoS Med* 2008;**5**:e100.